

dinî, siyasî ortamının onun ayrılışına zemin hazırladığı ve bununla beraber kendi fikrî problemlerinin de etkin rol oynadığı savunulur. Diğer taraftan Eş'arî'ye ait olduğu iddia edilen *el-İbâne* isimli esere dayanarak hüküm verenlerin genelde yanlış yorumlar yaptığı eleştirilir ve bu eserin Eş'arî'ye aidiyeti problemleri görülür. Başka bir eleştiri de onun Ahmed b. Hanbel'e tâbi olduğu ve onun böyle bir döneminin bulunduğunu savunanlara karşı getirilmektedir. Müellif burada ikisi arasında görüş ayrılıklarının olduğunu ve aynı zamanda aralarında metod farkının da bulunduğunu dile getirerek bunu kabul etmemektedir. Son olarak Eş'arî ve Eş'arîliğin arasının ayrılması gerektiğini savunanların görüşlerinin doğru olmadığını, daha sonraki Eş'arî âlimler tarafından serdedilen görüşlerle, Eş'arî'nin görüşlerinin paralellik arz ettiğini dile getirerek çalışmasına son vermektedir (s. 307-310).

Müellif Eş'arî hakkındaki öncül ve kabullerle ortaya çıkan netice arasındaki çıkarım sürecini sorgulamaktadır. Böylece ortada olan düşünce ve fikirlerin doğruluğunu tartışmaya çalışmıştır. Diğer taraftan Eş'arî ile Mu'tezile'yi, İbn Küllâb ekolünü ve kendisinden sonra gelen Eş'arî âlimlerin görüşlerini mukayese ederek Eş'arî ile ilgili önemli noktaları tespit etmeye çalışmıştır.

Mehmet Keskin'in bu çalışması, Eş'arî'nin hayatı ve Eş'arîlik üzerindeki etkisine dair Türkçe olarak yapılmış en kapsamlı çalışmadır. Çalışmada Eş'arî ile ilgili kaynaklarda yer alan bilgiler derli toplu bir şekilde sunulmaktadır. Eser, Eş'arî'nin Eş'arîlik içindeki yerine ilişkin genel bir fikir vermektedir. Aynı zamanda kelâm tarihine, özellikle Eş'arî ve Eş'arîlik alanlarına ilgi duyanlar için ve bu alanlarda çalışma yapmak isteyen araştırmacıların her zaman yararlanabileceği önemli bir araştırma eseridir.

Halil İbrahim Delen

(Yüksek Lisans Öğrencisi, İstanbul Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi)

Reform and Modernity in Islam: The Philosophical, Cultural and Political Discourses among Muslim Reformers

Safdar Ahmad

London: I.B.Tauris 2013, 296 pages

This book makes an important contribution to the contextualization of the discourse that falls within Islam and modernity. The corollaries of every narrative evolve from an essentialist "thought" process that acts as a lynchpin in every discursive tradition. All civilizational discourses have traversed different

conduits, eulogizing their narratives as the best alternatives for building a conscious and well-ordained world order. Amid the discursive notions is a newly developed phenomenon called Modernity. Safdar Ahmad has tried to uncover the relationship between Islam and Modernity, which is sometimes explained from a singular or transcendental definition or at times from a purely Eurocentric prism. However, modernity needs to be placed in its historical setting. The author historicizes Islamic reform within the diverse conditions of modernity. Critically examining the work of prominent intellectuals, such as Jamal al-Din Afghani, Muhammad Abduh and Allama Iqbal, Ahmad demonstrates how Muslim reformers have reconfigured the tenets of Western thought for their own needs, making Islam compatible with the modern world.

Exploring the work of key reformist thinkers in Islam, from the nineteenth century to the present day, through the Indian subcontinent to the Middle East, as well as in Europe and the U.S., this book places recent Islamic thought within the broader philosophical, cultural and political discourses of Modernity. Uncovering new historiographical perspectives of modernity vis-a-vis employed elements of postcolonial theory, critical theory and gender studies, the author challenges the singular conception of modernity. It is a strange phenomenon that the relationship between Islam and modernity is often viewed through a Eurocentric prism that posits Western norms as a template for progress against which Islamic societies are to be compared.

This book consists of seven chapters, in addition to the introduction, and a conclusion. Chapter One sets an analysis of the works of three nineteenth-century intellectuals, Jamal al-Din Afghani, Muhammad Abduh and Sayyid Ahmad Khan; these men attempted to reform Islam according to modern categories of knowledge. It is well known that each of these thinkers were impressed by the value of Western science, and sought to prove that Islam was compatible with modern reason. However, in the colonial context, science and reason were not value-free, given that they played an integrated part in the instrumentalization of colonial rule. For this reason, modernist reformers sought to separate what they perceived to be the useful from the useless elements of modern knowledge, thus generating the notion of entirely separate epistemologies, labeled “Islamic”, on one hand, and “materialist”, on the other. Thus, Islam could be proved a friend to modern thought while engaging in a defensive intellectual movement against the worst aspects of colonial knowledge.

The second and third chapters analyze the consequences of this for the production of cultural signs and meanings amongst indigenous reformers under colonial rule in the latter part of the nineteenth century. In Chapter Two, Safdar Ahmad examines the efforts of modernist intellectuals associated

with the Aligarh movement in northern India to reform the content of Urdu poetry. For these thinkers, a didactic notion of “progress” motivated efforts to reform the romantic Urdu *ghazal*, the imaginative, semi-mystical content of which was to be replaced with realistic, ideally “natural” themes. However, as I will argue, this movement for “natural poetry” led, instead, to the construction of a new literary romanticism, in which the idealized trope of the Muslim community, or nation-state, came to replace the conventional poetic figure of the “beloved”. Chapter Three is concerned with the discourse towards women of two important educationalists in colonial Egypt and India, Qasim Amin and Ashraf Ali Thanvi. These thinkers accepted the premise—implicit in colonial critiques of their culture—that women were the signifiers of society’s moral status, and sought to reform the position of women accordingly. However, I will argue that their attempts to construct the late nineteenth-century Muslim women as a modern civil subject were marked by ambiguity, and were symptomatic of the expectations and pressures exerted by the newly idealized status of women.

Chapter Four examines the implications in this struggle of the resplendent poet-philosopher, Muhammad Iqbal. His identification of Islam with the themes of modern nationalism (*qawmiyyah*) represents a signifier point of ambivalence in his work. This is shown in his adoption of the idea of race, to which Iqbal (and Iqbal’s idea of Islam) was nevertheless opposed. However, far from showing a contradiction or weakness in Iqbal’s thought, Ahmad argues that his ambivalence towards the themes of race-based nationalism was central to this dualism, which in turn contributed to notions of self and other, creation and creator, change and permanence, in his philosophical thought. Iqbal did not envisage Islam as a static national ideology, which no doubt undercuts his posthumously acquired status as a nationalist, or Islamist figure.

Chapter Five examines the presence of modern secular understandings in the work of the influential twentieth-century Islamists, Sayyid Abu al-A‘la Mawdudi and Sayyid Qutb. For instance, Mawdudi’s concept of a religious state attempts to place Islamic themes within the same morally abstract and universalizing terms as modern charters, draft constitutions, and so forth. Likewise, for Sayyid Qutb, Islam is realized through a non-rational, literary aesthetic interpretation of the Qur’an, which is equally indebted to modern categories, whilst Islamists present themselves as a radical alternative—and challenge—to a regnant Western secular epistemology. Here, I will argue that secular terms and understandings are derived from the premise upon which these themes are contested and defined. This insight is developed further, in Chapter Six, through an analysis of Mawdudi’s idealization of Muslim

femininity. This ambivalence is reemphasized here, in this chapter, titled “Mawdudi and the Gendering of Muslim Identity”. Abu al-A‘la Mawdudi idealizes Muslim women, cast against the backdrop of his perception of the Western woman, whom he pictures as a “self-centered abortionist, career woman and prostitute” (p. 196). By locating the normative Muslim women within a domain of binarised and conflicting significations, Mawdudi leads us to the “Western woman”, who is both victim and participant in the exploitation of her femininity. Indeed, I argue that Mawdudi’s understanding of female sexuality is so dependent upon the example of modern gender-types as to be inseparable from the recent history of Western sexual politics and morality in which he becomes embroiled.

Chapter Seven examines the efforts of “progressive” Muslim intellectuals to address the current impasse of hermeneutical thinking in contemporary Islamic thought. As modern Muslim reformers have, since the nineteenth century, disaggregated and selectively recombined elements of Islam’s intellectual and juristic traditions, the question of how to reform Islam for progressive Muslims mandates an examination of the historical context, circumstances and conditions under which such interpretation becomes possible. In this sense, I will explore how thinkers such as Fazlur Rahman, Amina Wadud, Abdul Kareem Soroush and Mohammad Arkoun have, in different ways, constructed the terms for a new hermeneutical project.

Far from making a complete survey of every event and thinker pertinent to the field, this book addresses certain themes and questions surrounding the subject of Islamic reform and its relationship to the philosophical, cultural and political discourses of modernity. For this reason, Ahmad’s examples are limited to a selected number of reformers whose work are representative of the relevant topics. In particular, he has focused on the ways in which Islam has been reformed, rethought, and in some sense reconstituted, as a response to, or means of substituting for, the various conditions of modern life.

A distinguished scholar, MacIntyre, believes that tradition can exist only if its members play an active part in defining its worth, and that it must be answerable to the needs of the time; Imam Malik has also used a somewhat similar notion of reformation when he states that “the reformation of this Ummah will happen the same way as has happened in previous generations.” Ahmad does not suggest that because universalist paradigms are self-undermining or because the modernist themes of progress and rationality have not always lived up to their promises we should somehow renounce them or seek an alternative elsewhere. On the contrary, we cannot simply discard our universalisms, let alone our cultural, national, religious or sexual identities. These are

valuable to sustaining the categories (of belonging, subjectivity, faith, gender and so forth) with which we make sense of the world and our place in it.

The entire discourse of this book sensitizes the ideological ruptures which evolved over time in the form of colonialism, European modernity and secular epistemology; these have been contested with tradition. The notion was to cross-fertilize the ideas of tradition and modernity and evolves a new narrative filled with intellectual equilibrium. In the contemporary discourse, registering the survival of a tradition, then, is to account for its contestation and re-conceptualization amongst those who have carried it through the historical changes of colonialism, capitalism and globalization.

This is a well-constructed work written with elegance vis-a-vis contextualizing the intellectual discourse in consideration of how Muslim intellectuals have dealt with “modernity”. Ahmad has cross-fertilized the intellectual ideas across different subjects and presented an informed interpretation of Islamic reformist thought of various kinds. The work is highly academic and translates the discourse of Islam and modernity in a very subtle manner, studying the engagements of modernity in an Eastern socio-cultural and intellectual setting. This book will prove helpful to all those scholars who want to understand the discourse of modernity in the Eastern world and how multi-dimensional responses have evolved a new narrative and paradigm of analyzing and understanding the engagements of Islam within an Eurocentric discourse.

Mehraj ud din Bhat

(Doctoral Candidate, Shah-i-Hamadan Institute of Islamic Studies, University of Kashmir)

Custom in Islamic Law and Legal Theory: The Development of the Concepts of “Urf and ‘Ādah” in the Islamic Legal Tradition

Ayman Shabana

New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010. xvi+246 sayfa.

Modernleşme sürecinde toplumsal hayatta yaşanan hızlı değişimin İslâm hukuku üzerinde oluşturduğu baskı ve bununla eş zamanlı olarak mezkûr hukuk sistemine yöneltilen ve İslâm dünyasındaki hukukî reform projelerine gerekçe yapılan durâğanlık eleştirileri, hukuk sistemlerinin toplumsal değişime uyum sağlama yeteneğinin göstergesi olan örflerle ilgili tartışmaların literatürde gittikçe daha fazla yer bulması sonucunu doğurmuştur. İslâm dünyasında